COURT OF CRIMINAL APPEALS NO.

APPEAL TO ALABAMA COURT OF CRIMINAL APPEALS

FROM

| CIRCUIT | COURT OF MON | TGOMERY | COUNTY, | ALABAMA |
|---|---------------------------|----------------------|---------|--------------------|
| | CIRCUIT COURT NO | CC 2002-1417 | | _ |
| | CIRCUIT JUDGE _ | HOBBS | | |
| Type of Conviction / Or Sentence Imposed: | rder Appealed From: | INTENTIONAL N | | |
| Defendant Indigent: | YES NO | | | |
| | | | | ARRYL JEVON JOYCE |
| AIMEE C. SMITH | | 34) 264- <u>6466</u> | N | NAME OF APPELLANT |
| (Appellant's Attorney) 640 S. MCDOUNOUGH | STREET | (Telephone No.) | | |
| (Address) MONTGOMERY | AL | 36104 | | |
| (City) | (State) | (Zip Codel | | |
| STATE OF ALABA | AMA | | | Masen on Appelling |
| (State represented by Attorne NOTE: If municipal appeal, name and address of munici | indicate above, and enter | | | NAME OF APPELLEE |
| | | | | |

(For Court of Criminal Appeals Use Only)

Part 4 of 5



saying. So I spoke back to them. 1 Q. Now you actually saw Eric and 2 3 Boo. They came up to you? Yes. 4 Before y'all got out of the 5 0. truck, did you see them in the area? 6 They was in the alley, I mean, 7 8 the little -- like where the building is. They standing in the yard between 9 10 the two buildings. Referring to State's 6, the 11 12 picture up on the screen? 13 Α. Yeah. Is that the two buildings you 14 1 5 are talking to? 1 6 Α. Yes. Is that what they are talking 17 about when they say the cut between the 1 8 19 two buildings? 20 Α. At the cut. 21 Q. Where were they standing? 22 Well, they were standing -- you 2 3 see like that Cadillac right there? They standing about right there, in between 24 5 that building right there.

Closer to the Cadillac? Q. 1 You know what I'm saying, 2 that's about where Boo was standing at. 3 Okay. 4 Q. Boo standing right there. 5 see, the Jeep was parked about a little 6 7 over towards the right by the driver's side of the Cadillac. 8 9 Q. Okay. The Jeep was over a little that Α. 10 11 way. But basically y'all were parked 1 2 in between those two buildings? 13 14 Α. Yeah. And Boo came up and spoke to 15 16 you? Yes. 17 Α. And then did you ever get out 18 of the car? 1 9 A. I got out because my brother 20 had got out. I got out and asked my 21 brother to let me go to the service 22 station. So I went to the service 23 24 station and came back. Now this is when you very first 2 5

qot there? 1 A. Yeah. 2 3 You saw them over by the Cadillac and then you got in the car and left? 5 A. I got in the truck and went to 6 the service station. 7 8 Q. How long did it take you to go to the service station? 9 It took me about ten or fifteen 10 minutes. I just went to the Racetrak 11 right up the street. 12 Q. And what did you get up there 13 14 at the Racetrak? 1 5 A six pack of Coronas and a 16 cigar. 17 For the party? Yeah, but the party was over. 1 8 I was going to drink that just outside, 19 20 you know what I'm saying. 21 Just you and your brother? Yeah, me and my brother. 2 2 2 3 Was anything kind of -- how 24 would you describe the party once y'all 2 5 got there?

- A. I ain't heard no music. There were a couple folks outside, you know what I'm saying. It was dead. It supposed to have been my cousin, Chris McQueen's, party. We asked where he was. They said he was in the house asleep, you know what I'm saying. So the party was over with when we got there.
- Q. Now what was going on when you came back from the store with the cigars and the beer?
- A. Well, they was out there arguing. So I called -- told Rabbit to tell my brother to come on. Told him to tell Johnny to come on.
 - O. Who did you tell that to?
 - A. Rabbit.
 - Q. Rabbit?
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. Now where were you in the truck at this point, the Jeep?
 - A. When I told Rabbit that?
 - O. Yeah.
 - A. On the driver's side.
 - Q. Where was the Jeep itself?

- A. Still backed in.
- Q. You backed in?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

1/4

1 5

116

17

1 8

19

20

21

22

2 3

24

- A. I backed in when I came from the service station.
 - Q. And then what happened?
- A. I got out and my brother got in, and I went around and got on the passenger side.
- Q. So correct me if I am wrong, but at this point the Jeep is backed in there and you are on the passenger side?
- A. I pulled in. I was driving. I backed back in so I told Eric to tell my brother to come on.
 - Q. Okay.
- A. Because, you know what I was saying, his girlfriend had the truck. So I let him get back in the driver's seat and I got out and went and got back in the passenger's side.
- Q. I'm going to show you real quick State's 5. Do you recognize that?
 - A. That's the truck.
- Q. Now, your brother is back in the driver's seat and y'all are both in

the Jeep. What happens now? Well, they -- they were still Α. 2 3 arguing. Now, when you say they, who 4 5 were you --James and Darryl. 6 And when you say Darryl, who 7 Ο. are you talking about? 8 9 Α. Joyce. Darryl Joyce? Q. 10 Α. 11 Yes. Q. What else does he go by? 1 2 13 Α. Poncho. 14 How did you know it was James 15 and Darryl Joyce out there arguing? Because -- I met Darryl through 16 Α. 1]7 Rabbit. 1 8 Through Rabbit? 19 A. Yeah. I met him through 20 Rabbit. Rabbit said this his home boy 21 out of prison, from prison. So that's 2 2 how I knew Darryl. I seen his face 2 3 once. I remember his face. I ain't 24 never forget it, you know what I'm saying, but I grew up with Boo, you know

what I'm saying. So that's how I knew 1 2 Boo. 3 Q. So you knew all the folks there that night? 4 5 A. Yeah. 6 And you specifically remember 7 seeing Darryl Joyce and Boo were the ones in the arqument? 8 9 Α. Yes. Did you hear what they were 10 arguing about? 11 12 No, I really didn't know what 13 they were arguing about. All I know it 14 was gang stuff, you know, you know what 1 5 I'm saying, gang related. 16 Q. Back and forth? 17 Gang related stuff back and 1 8 forth. 1 9 What is the next thing you Q. 20 remember happening? 21 Α. Then -- I know I heard Boo say, 22 man, I ain't no proud person. If I 23 wanted to do something to you, I could 24 have got you that night you were asleep 2 5 on the porch, you know what I'm saying.

You heard Boo say that? Q. 1 Yeah. Boo said that. 2 Α. 3 What happened next? Q. Then that's what I seen the gun 4 I seen him shoot him one time in the 5 up. leg. So by that time he shot him one 6 7 time in the leg. I'm looking back on the 8 passenger side. He shot towards our truck. He hit our truck three times. 9 Shot the windows out on my side. 10 11 Ο. Now pretend for me and the jury that you were sitting in the truck on the 1 2 1 3 passenger side. Okay. Pretend like the jury box there is the truck. 14 1 5 All right. Α. How are you looking behind you 16 to see what is going on? 17 Just like this. 18 Α. 1 9 Q. Okay. 20 I could see the whole thing. Α. How could you see the whole 21 2 2 thing? Because you see where the 2 3 corner of the house right there on the 24 25 other side where it says 406?

Uh-huh (indicating yes). **Q**. 1 That was about where they were 2 3 at, you know what I'm saying. Boo had made it to about right there when he shot 5 him one time in the leg, you know what I'm saying. 6 Q. Is your window up or is your 7 8 window down? A. My window was down. My head 9 was hanging out. So I guess that's why 10 they shot at the truck because he seen my 11 12 head hanging out. Q. Now be a little more clear. 1 3 Now if this is your window right here, 1 4 are you just looking back over your 1 5 shoulder? 1 6 I'm looking like this. 17 Α. 1 8 Looking out the window? Q. Α. Looking just like that. 19 20 What do you see? Q. I see him shoot Boo in the leg 21 Α. 2 2 one time. Who did you see shoot who? 2/3 Ο. Poncho. I seen Poncho shoot Α. 24 **1** 5 Boo.

Do you see the person that shot Q. 1 Boo in the courtroom here today? 2 Yes. Α. 3 Point him out to the jury. Ο. 4 That man right there, sir. 5 Α. Did you see that man there that 6 night? 7 8 Α. Yes, sir. How far were you from where you 9 Q. were in the truck back in that cut where 10 11 you saw him? From about -- from the -- the 1 2 Α. truck was backed all the way to the curb, 13 and he was at the end of the building 14 just standing at the back end of the 1 5 building about the second window. 16 1 7 Ο. Put me about where he would 18 have been standing if you are sitting in the truck. 19 20 I'd say about --Α. 2 1 From me to you? Q. 22 Something about thirty feet 2 3 back. 24 Q. Did he come forward or back 2 5 up?

Α. Huh? 1 If I am standing --2 Q. Α. You need to come up some. 3 Ο. Come up? 4 Yeah. About like that. 5 Α. About right there? Ο. 6 Α. Yeah. 7 When you looked back in the 8 truck, the guy you saw doing the shooting 9 was standing from me to you? 10 Yeah, about that much. That's 111 how he got a chance to shoot at our 12 1 3 truck. 14 Now what did you see the defendant do once you turned and were 1 5 looking out the window of that truck? 16 A. He shot at us three times. 17 Then I was telling my brother pull off. 1 8 While I'm telling my brother to pull out, 19 I'm still looking, you know what I'm 20 saying, to see if he shoot him again. He 21 22 already shot him about two or three more times, I guess. 2 3 Q. And you saw that? 24

5

Α.

I saw that. I saw Boo fell.

From the truck?

Ο.

1

From the truck. 2 Α. 3 Now once the shooting was over with, what did Darryl Joyce do? Take off through the back 5 6 field. 7 When you say the back field --Yeah. Through that way. Α. 8 9 Through the back. Like toward that tree? 10 No. He turned the corner. The 11 1 2 building right there, he turned back that 13 way. The other way from the tree? 1 4 Ο. 1 5 Yeah, toward the left side. Α. What did you and your brother 16 Ο. 17 do? 1 8 We had pulled -- we had pulled 19 off, you know what I'm saying. Then we backed back. We had went to the corner. 20 I said back on back. We backed on back. 21 That's when we came back and Rabbit was 22 over Boo just like that. 2 3 Q. Mr. Osborne, is there any doubt 4 2 5 in your mind that you saw this person

| i | 1 | sitting in the courtroom today shoot |
|---|---|--------------------------------------|
| | 2 | James Friendly? |
| | 3 | A. No, I ain't telling no I'm |
| | 4 | telling you the whole truth. |
| | 5 | Q. Did you know another person at |
| | 6 | the party named Bryant Thomas? |
| | 7 | A. No, sir. |
| | 8 | Q. You didn't know Bryant Thomas |
| | 9 | or known as B.T.? |
| 1 | 0 | A. I don't know him. |
| 1 | 1 | Q. What about a dude named Darryl |
| 1 | 2 | Foggy? |
| 1 | 3 | A. No. |
| 1 | 4 | Q. So all you know is what you saw |
| 1 | 5 | out there that night? |
| 1 | 6 | A. Yes. |
| 1 | 7 | MR. POWELL: Nothing further, |
| 1 | 8 | Judge. |
| 1 | 9 | CROSS-EXAMINATION |
| 2 | 0 | BY MR. HARTLEY: |
| 2 | 1 | Q. Mr. Osborne, y'all got out |
| 2 | 2 | there about what time that night? |
| 2 | 3 | A. It was it was late. I can't |
| 2 | 4 | recall. The party was over with. I |
| 2 | 5 | ain't |

- Q. I want to find out had you been drinking before you arrived at the scene there that night?
- A. No. We just had left my mama's house. I just had put on clothes.
- Q. So you are going to a birthday party that takes place over there in that neighborhood and you don't go until 11:30 at night?
- A. Well, we had to take his girlfriend to work and then we had to go to the party. But see we -- when they throw parties out there, they throw parties till in the morning time, you know what I'm saying.
- Q. Things get kind of wild out there, don't they?
 - A. Yeah.

1 3

1 5

1 6

2/3

- Q. Let me show you some of these exhibits. You looked at that picture over there and tried to refer to things that happened out there that night. It wasn't lit up like that that night, was it?
 - A. No.

Q. These are some photographs that were taken by police officers -- by the officer that came out there and photographed the scene. His pictures portray it to be fairly dark out there.

Is there any lighting that lights up that area behind the cars and between the buildings? Was there any lighting out there that night?

A. No.

1 2

3

d 5

- Q. So whatever you saw was in the dark shadows of those buildings, wasn't it?
- A. Yeah. But you could still see the person's face good though.
- Q. Well, if your brother testified that the persons that he saw back in there, standing back there near the buildings were in the shadow from the street light, it made it even darker. Would you agree with that or disagree with that?
- A. I can't say because my brother couldn't really see from the driver's side.

Q. Excuse me?

2 3

- A. My brother couldn't see from the driver's side so I couldn't really say.
- Q. If he said he saw the people that were back there but said he couldn't identify them, then it would be up to him to say whether or not he could see or not, right?
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. How many people did you see back there at that time?
 - A. Three.
 - Q. Three?
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. Well, what if your brother said he saw five?
- A. I didn't see but three. I seen three guys I know.
- Q. So your brother and you who were almost in exactly the same spot at exactly the time observed totally different numbers of people back there, right?
 - A. Yeah.

illuminates that area? That's supposed 1 to be the area in State's Exhibit Number 2 1 between the buildings. Do you see that 3 number 406 up there? 4 5 That's not in the parking lot though. 6 7 Ο. That's not? 8 I'm saying, he ain't at the 9 parking lot. He's taking pictures close 10 up. 11 This is the same area where the Q. 12 shooting took place, right? 1 3 Α. Yeah. That's a closeup 14 picture. 1 5 Q. It wasn't lit up like that, was 1 6 it? 17 Α. No. 1 8 And that bad lighting and the 19 inability to see is why you and your 20 brother have totally different versions **4**1 of how many people were out there, right? 22 Α. Yeah. 23 Did you see Darryl Foggy out 24 there? 25 Α. I don't even know Darryl Foggy.

| 1 | 1 | | Q. | Ιs | У | 7 O U | ır | b | rc |)t | hе | r | a | c q | u a | аi | n | te | d | wi | .th |
|----|---|-------|---------|------|------|------------|-----|-----|-----|--------------|-----|------------|-------|------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-----|
| | 2 | Darry | l Fog | 9 у | ? | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 3 | | Α. | I | d c | n' | t | е | ve | n | k | no | w | | | | | | | | |
| | 4 | | Q. | Di | d | ус | u | g | ee | : | Вr | уа | an' | t | T] | h o | ma | a s | c | ut | : |
| | 5 | there | e ? | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 6 | | Α. | Ι | d c | n' | t | е | vε | n | k | no | w | h | iı | n. | | | | | |
| | 7 | | Q. | Wh | 0 | d i | . d | У | ου | 1 | k n | 0 V | ۷. | t h | a 1 | t | w | as | â | ı t | |
| | 8 | this | party | ? | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 9 | | Α. | A 1 | 1 | I | k | n c | w | i | s | Вс | 00 | a | n | d | E | ri | С | ar | n d |
| 1 | 0 | I kno | w my | c c | ่น ธ | sin | 1 | C h | ıri | . s | M | c Ç | Qu. | e e | n | | | I | kг | 1 O V | j |
| 1 | 1 | they | were | h a | vi | n c | 3 | th | е | p. | ar | t <u>y</u> | 7. | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 2 | | Q. | W€ | :11 | - <i>,</i> | n | 0 W | 7, | I | ' m | r | 10 | t | c : | l e | a: | r. | | Wh | nen |
| 1 | 3 | you f | irst | gc | t | tŀ | ı e | re | ÷ , | d | id | 3 | 70 | u | 8 | а у | | t h | a t | 5 | |
| 1 | 4 | they | came | οv | rei | î a | n | d | sp | 00 | kе | t | . 0 | У | 01 | u | a · | t | УС | ur | - |
| 1 | 5 | vehic | le wh | e n | ı y | 70 U | 1 | fі | rs | вt | g | o t | Ξ. | t h | e : | re | : (| or | V | v h e | n |
| 1 | 6 | you r | eturn | e d | l f | rc | m | t | h e |) | st | 0 1 | сe | ? | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 7 | | Α. | Wh | er | ı I | - | fi | rs | ŧt | g | o t | - | t h | e: | re | • • | | | | |
| 1 | 8 | | Q. | Αn | ı d | th | ı e | У | Сā | a m | е | 7 0 | z e : | r | a : | n d | l ; | sp | o k | се | to |
| 1 | 9 | you? | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 0 | | Α. | Rа | bb | oit | 2 | | - | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 1 | | Q. | Ηс | W | m a | n | У | pε | 0 | рl | е | C | a m | е | 0 | v | er | t | : h e | en? |
| 2 | 2 | | Α. | Τw | 10. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 3 | | Q. | Jυ | st | : t | w | 0 | ре | 0 | рl | e i | ? | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 4 | | Α. | Τw | 10, | F | ≀a | bb | oit | : | a n | d | В | 00 | | | | | | | |
| ۱, | 5 | | \circ | 7. + | | TA7 C | ~~ | _ | + } | | 1.7 | a 1 | ca. | ıı i | n | ィワ | | | | | |

| | 1 | | Α. | Uh-huh (indicating no). They |
|---|-----|-------|--------|---------------------------------|
| | 2 | were | home | boys. |
| | 3 | | Q. | Wait a minute. But you don't |
| | 4 | know | Darry | l Foggy, do you? |
| | 5 | | Α. | No, sir. |
| | 6 | | Q. | Nicknamed D? You don't know |
| | 7 | him? | | |
| | 8 | | Α. | (Witness nodding head |
| | 9 | negat | ively | 7.) |
| 1 | 0 | | | MR. HARTLEY: No further |
| 1 | 1 | quest | ions. | |
| 1 | 2 | | | REDIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 1 | 3 | BY MR | . POW | VELL: |
| 1 | 4 | | Q. | Mr. Osborne, after you heard |
| 1 | 5 | those | guns | shots out there that night, did |
| 1 | 6 | anybo | dy ta | ake off running? |
| 1 | 7 | | Α. | Well, ain't nobody I ain't |
| 1 | 8 | seen | nobod | ly run but Poncho. |
| 1 | 9 | | Q. | Were there other people |
| 2 | 0 | stand | ling a | around like on the porch and |
| 2 | 1 | that | kind | of thing that you were able to |
| 2 | 2 | see? | | |
| 2 | 3 | | A . | No. No, sir. |
| 2 | . 4 | | Q. | You didn't see it or there |
| 2 | | wasn' | t any | body standing there? |

| , | 1 | | Α. | I d | idn | 't s | e e | it. | I d | idn | t pay |
|---|---|-------|-------|-----|-----|------|-----|------|------|------|-------|
| | 2 | no at | tenti | on | to | it. | Ве | caus | e wh | en h | е |
| | 3 | start | ed sh | oot | ing | at | the | tru | ck, | I wa | s |
| | 4 | telli | ng my | br | oth | er p | ull | off | • | | |
| | 5 | | Q. | You | we | re f | ocu | sed | on w | here | the |
| | 6 | shots | were | СО | min | g fr | om? | | | | |
| | 7 | | Α. | Whe | re | the | bul | lets | com | ing | from, |
| | 8 | you k | now w | hat | I' | m sa | yin | g. | | | |
| | 9 | | Q. | So | if | ther | e w | ere | othe | r pe | ople |
| 1 | 0 | stand | ing a | rou | nd | or t | ook | off | run | ning | |
| 1 | 1 | | Α. | I d | on' | t ev | en | know | abo | ut i | t. |
| 1 | 2 | | Q. | | you | wou | ldn | 't k | now | that | ? |
| 1 | 3 | | Α. | Uh- | huh | (in | dic | atin | g no |) . | |
| 1 | 4 | | Q. | Now | wh | en t | hе | gun | shot | , di | d any |
| 1 | 5 | fire | come | out | οf | it? | | | | | |
| 1 | 6 | | Α. | Wel | 1, | you | | a li | ttle | • | |
| 1 | 7 | | Q. | A 1 | itt | le? | | | | | |
| 1 | 8 | | Α. | You | сa | n't | say | muc | h. | Just | a |
| 1 | 9 | littl | e fir | e c | ame | out | • | | | | |
| 2 | 0 | | Q. | But | уо | u we | re | able | to | see | that? |
| 2 | 1 | • | Α. | Yea | h. | | | | | | |
| 2 | 2 | | | MR. | ΡO | WELL | : | Noth | ing | furt | her, |
| 2 | 3 | Judge | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 4 | | | MR. | ΗA | RTLE | Υ: | Not | hing | fur | ther. |
| 2 | 5 | | | ТНЕ | CO | URT: | 0 | kау. | | | • |

MR. HARTLEY: One more.

BY MR. HARTLEY:

1 2

1 7

2 4

- Q. Let me refer to your statement. This is page eleven. You gave a statement to the police, Detective Townsend, on the day after the event.
 - A. Yes.
- Q. It starts off, is your name Brian Osborne?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Does that appear to be a transcript of your statement? Did you say that?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. On page eleven, you said so -- you are describing -- after the officer asked you questions about what happened, then you said -- you heard about five shots.

MR. HARTLEY: This is the -- the fourth question down, Counsel.

Q. So, you know -- I'm going to read this for him if counsel does not object. You know what I'm saying, we looked up and when I seen the dude Poncho

running behind the building, my brother pulled off.

Why would you have to say you looked up if you'd been looking out the window and had your head turned around and looking back the whole time?

A. I ain't say that.

1 5

1 8

2 3

- Q. You didn't say that?
- A. They probably had it wrote because we were talking too fast, you see what I'm saying.
- Q. You are saying that the police typed --
- A. I'm saying they typed up my date of birth wrong, you see what I'm saying.
- Q. So you are saying in the original statement you did not say I looked up and then saw Poncho running off?
- A. I know I was paying attention. I was looking all the time.
- Q. I am asking, if they say in that typed statement, so you know what I'm saying, I looked up -- I mean, I

1 5

2 1

2 5

looked up when I seen the dude Poncho running behind the building. You are saying that that is not something you said?

- A. Well, it's on paper. It's got to be.
- Q. So now you are saying you did look up at some point. That implies that you ducked down and then looked back up, right?
- A. I did not -- the whole time he was shooting, I seen it from my own eyes. From my own eyes, I seen this.
- Q. Well, what does that mean when you say we looked up? We looked up. What does that mean?
- A. Like I say, my brother, you know what I'm saying. Because it was me and my brother in the truck.
- Q. Next question down. It says, between the third and fourth shot, did you duck down? And what did you answer?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Okay. So they asked you if you ducked and you said yes, sir. Correct?

- A. Yes. Wouldn't you duck if you shot at three or four times.
- Q. I'm just asking, were you looking the whole time or were you not looking the whole time?
- A. I ducked after he shot at our truck. But when he shooting Boo, I seen that from my own eyes.
- Q. Now you have changed your testimony from where you were looking back the whole time now to where you did duck down at some point along the way, right?

Because when you answered that question, okay, all right. Did you duck down, your answer was affirmative. What does it say?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Okay. Now do you admit that you said that to the police officer?
 - A. It's on paper. It got to be.
- Q. So you in fact did duck down during part of that event, didn't you? Did you?
 - A. After he shot at our truck.

| | 1 | | Q. | Okay | . S | 0 | you | were | en't | 1.0 | ookin | g |
|---|---|-------|-------|------|-------|-----------------|------|------|------|-------|-------|-----|
| | 2 | back | the w | hole | tim | ıe? | | | | | | |
| | 3 | | Α. | Веса | use | gl | ass | and | stu | ff | was | |
| | 4 | still | flyi | ng. | | | | | | | | |
| | 5 | | Q. | You | were | : 1 | ooki | ng 1 | oack | at | tha | t |
| | 6 | area | that | was | dark | . b | ehin | d y | our | veh | nicle | ? |
| | 7 | | Α. | Yeah | | | | | | | | |
| | 8 | | | MR. | HART | LE | Y: | Oka | 7 - | No | furt | her |
| | 9 | quest | ions. | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | | | REDI | RECI | <u>' E</u> | IMAX | NAT | ON | | | |
| 1 | 1 | BY MR | . POW | ELL: | - | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 2 | | Q. | I th | ink | Μr | . На | rtle | ∋у π | nay | have | |
| 1 | 3 | skipp | ed ov | er o | ne c | _I ue | stic | n, l | Mr. | 0 s k | orne | • |
| 1 | 4 | Now t | he pa | rt h | e wa | i S | refe | rri | ng t | : O V | vhere | hе |
| 1 | 5 | was t | alkin | gab | out, | I | 'm s | ayi | ng w | e] | looke | d |
| 1 | 6 | up. | That' | s ri | ght | hе | re, | is . | it r | ot? | ? | |
| 1 | 7 | | Α. | Yes. | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 8 | | Q. | The | very | n n | ext | que | stic | n, | what | is |
| 1 | 9 | that? | • | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | 0 | | A . | Yes, | sir | î . | | | | | | |
| 2 | 1 | | Q. | Does | it | sa | у, с | lid | you | act | tuall | Y |
| 2 | 2 | see I | oncho | pul | 1 t } | ıe | trig | gger | ?] | s t | chat | the |
| 2 | 3 | quest | ion? | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | | | Α. | Yes, | sir | · | | | | | | |
| , | 5 | | 0 | And | the | an | SWer | - is | ves | 5. 8 | sir. | I |

saw the fire? 1 Α. Yes, sir. 2 That's what it says? 3 Α. Yes. 4 Q. That was actually the next 5 question? 6 Yeah, before that. And then he asked you, so where 8 And your answer was Boo had -was Boo? 9 Boo was right there. He had fell on the 10 ground by then. By that time he had 11 fell; is that right? 12 Yes, sir. 1 3 Α. Q. And then he starts asking you 14 that's when the vehicle got shot and 15 that's when you ducked? 16 17 Α. Yes. Q. Okay. 1 8 MR. POWELL: Nothing further, 19 20 judge. THE COURT: You want to ask one 21 more question again, Mr. Hartley? 22 MR. HARTLEY: No. 2 3 (Off-the-Record Discussion.) **4** THE COURT: You can step down. **d** 5

1 2

2 5

Thank you, sir. Ladies and gentlemen, we are going to break for the day. I appreciate your patience. We are going to start back at 9:00 in the morning unless somebody tells me -- if that creates a problem for you. Is that okay for everybody?

I think -- hopefully we can finish the evidence before lunch anyway. Maybe even get the law to you and all that. We can -- y'all can start deliberating tomorrow afternoon.

In the meantime, remember don't let anybody discuss the case with you.

Don't discuss the case with each other.

Don't try to do an independent investigation of the facts in this case.

Don't get on the internet. I can promise you the first thing that is going to happen when you go home tonight is your wife or your husband or your children, somebody is going to say tell me about the case. Don't start talking about it with them. Don't tell them anything because they are going -- as soon as you

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1 4

15

1 6

17

1 8

19

20

21

22

2 3

24

a 5

start telling them about the case, they are going to throw their two cents in.

They are going to throw two cents in and they don't know anything about case.

They hadn't heard word one. It just takes us in an area where we don't want to go.

I hadn't seen anybody from the newspaper or anything in here today but you never know. Something could be reported on the news or something about it. Just don't read anything about the case. Don't listen to anything on the news. I have yet to read a news account of a case where they got it right. is always something in there that they don't quite get. And since they are not even here, anything they write is going to be what somebody told them. It just gets all messed up. So if you see an article in the newspaper or you watch the news and they start talking about something that went on at the courthouse just cover your ears. Just please don't listen to them. It just causes more

```
1
            problems than it is worth.
 2
                       Good night. Thank y'all
 3
                    If y'all would be back at the
 4
            jury assembly room at 9:00 in the jury
 5
            assembly room, we'll come get you.
 б
            will start first thing in the morning.
 7
                       (The jury exits the courtroom.)
 8
                       (COURT ADJOURNED.)
 9
10
11
12
13
1 4
1 5
1 6
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
2 5
```

June 22, 2003

THE COURT: Good morning. Glad to have you back. The reason we started at nine is in case you didn't know, we had some other matters to attend to this morning. We have gotten those out of the way and we are ready to get started. Mr. Powell.

 $$\operatorname{\mathtt{MR}}$.$ POWELL: The State calls Detective Gino Howton.

E.E. HOWTON,

having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. POWELL:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1 2

13

14

15

16

1 7

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. Detective, could you state your name for the members of the jury?
 - A. Corporal E.E. Howton.
 - Q. And how are you employed?
- A. I'm a homicide detective for the Montgomery Police Department.
- Q. How long have you been a homicide detective?
 - A. About six-and-a-half years.
 - Q. How long have you been a

- Q. And what about specifically any training or specialized class work you have done as a robbery homicide detective?
- A. Been through investigation classes. I have been to interrogation classes. You know, interview classes, stuff like that.
- Q. Now, Detective, you are what is referred to as a case agent in this case; is that right?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Describe for the jurors what that means.
- A. I am responsible for basically putting the case together in whatever the situation is and I am responsible for collecting, gathering evidence from not only information that I have obtained but from other sources and end up putting it in a case file such as this.
- Q. So basically you are the primary or lead detective on this case?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Are you the main detective involved in investigating the circumstances

of this case? 1 After I was called in, yes, I was. 3 So basically all the documents 4 and everything related to this case come to 5 you? 6 Yes. 7 Α. Now, Detective, when were you 8 first called in on this case? 9 Saturday morning about 3:30 in 10 the morning. 11 What happened? Q. 12 I was contacted at my house by my 13 lieutenant. He told me that there had been 14 a shooting out at Smiley Court and one of 15 the subjects -- the subject that had been 16 shot died and he needed me to respond to 17 headquarters at that time. 18 At that point did this become 19 your case? 20 After I got to headquarters it 21 was, yes. 22 What did you do to follow up and 2/3 begin investigating this incident? 24 25 Well, I started getting

information from the late car detectives as to basically what the situation was out in Smiley Court when they got there. The individuals that were involved and potential witnesses that had already been interviewed, getting their names, addresses, so forth.

- Q. Did you ever go back and reinterview any of those witnesses?
 - A. Yes, I did.

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1 3

14

1 5

1 6

17

18

19

20

21

22

2 3

- Q. Now from your initial processing of this information, talking to these witnesses, did you develop any suspects?
- A. I was initially given the name of a subject at headquarters by the name of Darryl Joyce or Darryl Joiner. That's what was originally given to me.
- Q. Okay. Now, did you talk to any other witnesses -- did you talk to any other witnesses as you continued following up on this information?
- A. Yes. I spoke to a black female that was out there. I spoke to Eric Stewart.
 - Q. That would be Rabbit who we have

already heard from? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 Do you know the name of the black female you spoke with? 4 5 Α. Ms. Judkins. 6 Whose residence was the party at? 7 Ms. Judkins. Α. 8 So you spoke to the lady that was 9 having the party? ᆲᇬ Α. Right. 11 From that conversation, did you develop any other possible names or 1 2 1 3 possible suspects? 14 Well, there was another subject 1 5 that was named Darryl as well. So we got two Darryls at the 16 Q. 1 7 party? 1 8 We had two Darryls at the party. One was the original suspect that was given 19 to me, the other subject was known as D., 20 21 Darryl Foggy. 22 Q. Darryl Foggy? 2/3 Α. Yes. 24 So let me make sure I'm clear. Q. **1** 5 We got one Darryl which is Darryl Joyce?

| - 1 | | |
|-----|-----|---|
| | 1 | A. Right. |
| | 2 | Q. Is this that Darryl Joyce? |
| | 3 | A. Yes. |
| | 4 | Q. The one in the courtroom today? |
| | 5 | A. Yes. |
| | 6 | Q. And the other Darryl is Darryl |
| | 7 | oggy? |
| | 8 | A. Yes. |
| | 9 | Q. And those were basically the two |
| 1 | 0 | arryls you had at that party? |
| 1 | .1 | A. Yes. |
| 1 | 2 | Q. How did you follow up with those |
| 1 | . 3 | two names to determine which one was your |
| 1 | 4 | suspect? |
| 1 | . 5 | A. Well, like I said, I |
| 1 | 6 | ceinterviewed Eric Stewart, Rabbit. Of |
| 1 | 7 | course, he was adamant that Darryl Foggy |
| 1 | 8 | was not involved in the shooting. He was |
| 1 | 9 | at the party but he was not involved in the |
| 2 | 0 | actual shooting of Mr. Friendly. |
| 2 | 1 | Q. Okay. |
| 2 | 2 2 | A. He later gave me the location of |
| 2 | 2 3 | where a handgun which belonged to Darryl |
| 2 | 4 | Foggy could be located where I eventually, |
|) ; | 2 5 | myself and another detective, went to a |
| | | |

residence across the street from Ms. 1 Judkins where we collected a nine 2 millimeter. 3 Q. I'm going to show you State's 4 Do you recognize this? 5 Yes, sir. This is the firearm Α. handgun which we recovered from Amy 7 Albright's apartment. 8 And Amy Albright lived where in 9 relation to this incident? 10 Just right across the street. 11 And the information you had that 1 2 Ο. led you to this handgun in Amy Albright's 1 3 apartment came from who? 14 Eric Stewart. 1 5 Α. And you were able to collect this 16 Ο. 17 gun? Α. Yes. 1 8 Once you had it in your custody, 19 what did you do with it? 20 21 It was sent to DFS. What does that mean? 22 It was sent to the Department of 23 24 Forensic Sciences to have it examined to see if the round came -- that was recovered 2 5

1 from the victim came from that gun. 2 Q. Were you aware of any projectiles 3 that were recovered from the victim? 4 We were aware that three shell 5 casings were recovered from the area. 6 Q. From the crime scene? A. Yes. 8 And what about an actual bullet 9 that came out of the victim from an 10 autopsy? 11 Α. We recovered one round from the 12 victim. 1 3 Q. I'm going to show you what we have marked collectively as State's 15, 16 14 15 and 17, and ask you if you recognize these? 16 A. These are the shell casings which 17 were recovered from the crime scene. 18 Ο. Do those appear to be in the same 19 -- do those casings appear to be in the 20 same or substantially the same condition as 21 the last time you saw them or had them in 22 your custody? 23 Α. Yes. **4** MR. POWELL: We offer State's 15,

16 and 17.

2 2

2/3

24

2 5

MR. HARTLEY: Judge, I don't think the chain of custody has been fully established.

MR. POWELL: We'll wait on admissability, Judge.

THE COURT: I will let them in.

(State's Exhibit Numbers 15, 16

and 17 admitted into evidence.)

- Q. Now, Detective Howton, do you know who collected these shell casings from the scene?
 - A. Detective Grandison.
- Q. And do you know what Detective Grandison did with these shell casings?
 - A. Impounded them.
- Q. And then once they -- when you say they were impounded, explain to the jurors what that means.
- A. He took them and eventually placed them into the supply and evidence room down at headquarters, which eventually the casings were submitted to DFS through the crime scene bureau tech.
- Q. How does that work? How did the crime scene bureau tech get the shell

3

casings from y'all's evidence room over to the DFS?

- A. We fill out a request form, and once that request form is filled out we give them a copy of it and they receive that copy. Then in turn they go back to the supply and evidence room and retrieve the shell casings at which time then they transport it out to DFS and we release it to them.
- Q. To your knowledge, was anybody else in your chain of custody besides

 Detective Grandison, the evidence tech in this case that transported the bullets, the DFS person that tested the bullets or yourself who received them back from DFS?
- A. I'm not aware of anybody else, no.
- Q. Now, Detective, so basically what you had from physical evidence of the scene was a bullet from the victim's body, these three shell casings, and State's 21, which is a handgun purported to be from Darryl Foggy; is that correct?
 - A. That's correct.

Ο. Did you ever find Darryl Foggy? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 Were you able to take a statement from Darryl Foggy? 4 5 Α. Yes. 6 And after you had got the results 7 back from that handgun and talked to Darryl 8 Foggy, who did you sign warrants on? 9 Α. Mr. Joyce. 10 Was there any other evidence 11 implicating Darryl Joyce in this incident 12 other than Eric Stewart's testimony? 13 A. Well, the fact -- I couldn't find 1 4 him. 1 5 Q. You couldn't find him? 16 I couldn't find him, no. Α. 17 Were you ever able to recover a 18 gun or any type of firearm from Mr. Joyce 19 or his residence or anything associated 20 with him? 21 No. Α. 22 Were there any other witnesses 23 that identified Mr. Joyce as being the **4** shooter? **d** 5 A. You had Eric Stewart. You had

Brian Osborne.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

111

12

13

14

15

1 6

17

18

19

20

2 1

2 2

2 3

24

- Q. Now, Detective --
- A. And I believe you had Mr. Foggy.
- Q. Do you know when you arrested Darryl Joyce?
- A. It was approximately -- it was on February the 11th when he was actually arrested out in California.
- Q. What do you mean he was arrested in California?
- A. He was stopped in a traffic stop by some officers out in Los Angeles or in that area where he used a fake name and had a fake ID, and they charged him with that.
- Q. How were you able to identify the person in California as your suspect Darryl Joyce?
- A. He used the name of Willie Faulk, and that is his mother's maiden name. We had a lookout on him at that time, which was NCI. We had a nationwide lookout on him. We ended up sending a certified copy of some fingerprints of Mr. Joyce out to LA, and in turn they sent a photograph back to us. They were able to verify the

fingerprints that belonged to Darryl Joyce 1 2 at that time. Did you take a look at the 3 photographs? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Were you able to verify the 6 photographs? 7 A. I just -- just that one 8 photograph they sent to me. I told them 9 that he had a habit of bending his lip 10 whenever a photograph was taken of him to 11 kind of distort the photograph. When I got 12 the photograph back from LA, that's what I 13 had was a photograph of him, which I 4 identified, and him biting his upper lip. 15 When did this incident occur, 1 6 Detective Howton, the shooting? 17 Actually, on the 1st of February 18 of 2002. 19 And when was the next time any 20 law enforcement had contact with this 21 defendant? 22 When he was arrested out in Los 23 Α. That was on the 11th. 24 Angeles. 2 5 The 11th, ten days later? Ο.

Α. Yes. 1 He was all the way in Los 2 0. Angeles, California? 3 Α. Yes. 4 5 Ο. 6 7 8 9 Α. 10 11 Α. photographs of --12 13 14 15 you. 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 2/3 introduced in this trial, Judge. 24 2/5 (An off-the-record discussion was

Now, Detective, I want to show you what I have marked for identification purposes only as State's 28. Explain to the jurors what State's 28 is. This is a mug book that we have. What does that mean? Well, it has got -- it contains THE COURT: Can you speak up, Detective. I don't think everyone can hear A. This is a mug book. It has a -or has photographs of several individuals which have been arrested over a period of time, and they are collected in this book. MR. HARTLEY: Judge, I object and move for a mistrial. The evidence -- whatever the history of all these people in this book should not be

held outside the presence and hearing of the jury and the court reporter.)

objection. Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, the fact that the police department has a photograph of Mr. Joyce is not to be considered by you any implication that he is guilty or innocent in this case. It is not evidence of guilt, the fact that they had a photograph of Mr. Joyce.

They have got lots of photographs and that's not to be considered by you.

Does everybody understand that? Does anybody have a problem with treating that as not being an indication of his guilt?

Okay.

- Q. You were talking about the book with a bunch of photographs in it?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. Now, is the defendant's picture in that book?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Could you open the book to the page with the defendant's picture on it?
 - A. (Witness complies.)

| | 1 | Q. | Is this the page with the |
|---|-----|------------|----------------------------------|
| | 2 | defendant' | s picture on it? |
| | 3 | Α. | Yes. |
| | 4 | Q. | Did you use this book at any |
| | 5 | point duri | ng the course of your |
| | 6 | investigat | cion? |
| | 7 | А. | Yes |
| | 8 | Q. | Explain to the jurors how you |
| | 9 | used this | book. |
| 1 | L 0 | Α. | Just presented the book to some |
| 1 | . 1 | of the wit | nesses and let them see if they |
| 1 | 1 2 | could iden | ntify Mr. Joyce. |
| 1 | 13 | Q. | Was Eric Stewart one of those |
| 1 | _ 4 | witnesses? | |
| 1 | . 5 | Α. | Yes. |
| 1 | . 6 | Q. | Was he able to identify the |
| 1 | . 7 | defendant? | |
| 1 | 1.8 | Α. | Yes. |
| h | _ 9 | Q. | Did you show this book to either |
| 2 | 2 0 | one of the | e Osbornes? |
| 2 | 2.1 | Α. | Not me, but I believe one of the |
| 2 | 2 2 | other dete | ectives did. |
| 2 | 2 3 | Q. | And could you point out to the |
| 2 | 2.4 | jurors whi | ch one of the pictures on these |
| 2 | 2 5 | two pages | is Mr. Joyce? |
| 1 | | | |

Α. The top one right here. 1 And is that the same picture or 2 3 different picture from the one Eric Stewart identified? 4 5 A. I believe that's the same picture 6 it came from out of the book. The same picture. And Eric Ο. Stewart used this book to positively 8 9 identify the defendant Darryl Joyce? 10 Α. Yes. Now, Detective, did you ever go 1 out to this crime scene? 12 3 Yes. Α. 1 4 So you are familiar with the layout and the evidence where it was 15 collected? 16 17 A. I know the general area, yes, 18 sir. 19 The general area? Ο. 20 Α. Yes, sir. 21 I'm going to show you a series of 22 photographs and ask you to take a look at these real quick. First, let's start with 23 24 -- here it is right here. Let's start

with State's 27 and 27-A. I believe

State's 27 and 27-A have been combined 1 together, put on the board there. Do you 2 recognize that? 3 Yes, sir. Α. 4 What is it? Ο. 5 It is a drawing that I did, 6 7 completed in reference to the crime scene and the general area of the crime scene. 8 To your knowledge, this is not to 9 Q. scale? 10 No, it's not to scale. 11 With that exception, does this 1 2 13 fairly and accurately represent the way the crime scene looked on the night of the 1 4 1 5 shooting? Α. Yes. 16 17 MR. POWELL: We offer 27 and 1 8 27-A, Judge. THE COURT: It is admitted. 19 (State's Exhibit Numbers 27 and **4**0 **1**1 27-A admitted into evidence.) Detective Howton, I have got a **4**2 Q. 23 series of photographs here, State's 1, and some of these other ones have already been 24

admitted. State's 1 through 6. Do you

recognize those? 1 2 It is photos of the crime scene. A. 3 Are you familiar with those? Q. 4 Α. Yes. 5 I want you to go ahead and take a б look for me at State's 7 through 14. 7 Α. (Witness complies.) 8 Just look through real quick and Q. tell me if you recognize those. 9 10 It is a photograph of the crime 11 scene of that area. This is during 12 daylight hours though. 13 It is a different photograph of Q. the crime scene? 14 15 Α. Yes. 16 Do these appear to be fair and 17 accurate representations --18 MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, I 19 object. I don't believe Mr. Howton was out 20 there. No testimony has been brought forth 21 as to when he was out there or what 22 occasions he was out there and what time he 2/3 was out there. So I'm not sure how Mr. 24 Powell can ask him if they fairly and 2 5 accurately depict the scene if he wasn't

1 out there the night that the scene was 2 investigated. 3 THE COURT: When was he out there? 4 5 Detective, when did you actually 6 go to the crime scene to look at these two 7 apartment buildings? 8 I was out there that Saturday 9 morning around 5:30 in the morning. 10 Did you ever go back out there 11 subsequently? Well, that was the first time I 12 13 went out there was that Saturday morning 14 around 5:30. And have you ever been over to 15 the area of Marlyn Street in Smiley Court 16 17 before? Oh, yes, many times. 18 19 How many times have you been out 20 there to that area in general? Α. Several. 21 Are you familiar with the basic 22 23 setup of the apartment buildings and the 24 areas that are located on Smiley Court? 25 A. Yes, sir.

| 1 | | Q. | And | fron | n you | ur k | nowle | edge, | based |
|---|-------|-------|------|-------|---------|-------|-------|--------|----------|
| 2 | both | speci | fica | ally | on t | this | case | e and | from |
| 3 | your | knowl | edge | of | the | nei | ghbo: | rhood | in |
| 4 | gener | al, d | o th | nese | pic | ture | s app | pear t | o be |
| 5 | fair | and a | ccur | ate | rep | rese | ntat | ions d | of the |
| 6 | areas | surr | ound | ling | the | 400 | 0 bl | ock of | Marlyn |
| 7 | Stree | t? | | | | | | | |
| 8 | | Α. | Yes, | siı | · . | | | | |
| 9 | | | MR. | POWE | ELL: | Wе | offe | er the | ese |
| 0 | photo | graph | s. | | | | | | |
| 1 | | | THE | COUP | T: | Adm | itte | d. | |
| 2 | | | (Sta | ate's | Exl | hibi | t Nu | mbers | 7 |
| 3 | throu | gh 14 | adm | nitte | ed i | nto | evide | ence.) | |
| 4 | | Q. | Now, | Det | ect: | ive, | we j | prepar | ed a |
| 5 | Power | point | den | nonst | rat | ion, | a mo | onitor | ring aid |
| 6 | to as | sist | you | in y | our | tes | timo | ny. | |
| 7 | | | Woul | d th | nat a | assi | st y | ou in | |
| 8 | expla | ining | t h∈ | 100 | catio | ons | of s | everal | items |
| 9 | of ph | ysica | l ev | vider | ice t | to t | he jı | ıry? | |
| 0 | | Α. | Yes, | sin | · . | | | | |
| 1 | | Q. | What | are | e we | 100 | king | at or | n the |
| 2 | scree | n? | | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Α. | That | :'s t | he o | draw | ing t | that I | Ī |
| 4 | compl | eted | and | the | lege | e n d | that | went | with it |
| 5 | | 0 | Does | : the | n n h c | at oa | ranh | that | iust |

appeared on the screen, I believe it is 1 marked State's 1, what is that a photograph 2 3 of? That's going to be a photograph 4 5 of the area in between the two buildings 6 where the shooting occurred. 7 Q. And the arrow, what does that indicate? 8 9 A. That's the general area where the 10 shooting occurred. 11 Q. Now the next photograph that came up, I believe it is State's 6. What is 12 1/3 that a photograph of? 14 A. That's the same area except it's a photograph in daylight. 15 16 Now that's a closeup. To the 17 best of your knowledge, is this where the 18 shooting occurred? 19 A. Yes, sir. 20 Q. And this is a different 21 photograph? 22 Yes, sir. Α. 2/3 What does that circle indicate? 24 That's where the victim and the Α. 2 5 shell casings were located.

| 1 | | Q. | Now | , | t h | e t | h | re (| e : | p h | . o t | . 0 | g: | ra | рł | າຣ | th | ıat | t |
|-----|-------|-------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|-----|-----|-------|-----|-----|-----|-------|------|----------|----------|-------|
| 2 | just | appea | red | , | wh | at | a ı | re | t | hо | se | ∋? | | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Α. | Tho | s e | a: | re | t ł | nе | s | h e | 1] | L | c i | a s | ir | ng s | 3 V | /h: | ich |
| 4 | were | locat | e d | аt | t I | he | នឲ | cei | ne | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5 | | Q. | And | t | hе | сi | r | c 1 (| e s | t | h a | аt | | j u | .st | = | | | |
| 6 | appea | red, | wha | t | do | th | ı e y | Y | in | dі | Ca | аt | e ' | ? | | | | | |
| 7 | | Α. | The | ន | h e | 11 | C a | as. | in | g s | | | | | | | | | |
| 8 | | Q. | And | t | ho | se | C a | as. | in | g s | t | : h | a · | t | a ı | ce | | | |
| 9 | circl | ed in | th | os | e ; | pho | to | og: | ra | рh | នេ | r | a: | re | : t | ho | າສ€ | <u> </u> | t h e |
| 0 | same | casin | gs | t h | at | w e | e l | n a | vе | a | dr | ni | t | tе | d | ir | ıtc |) | |
| . 1 | evide | nce a | s S | ta | tе | ' ន | 1 5 | 5, | 1 | 6 | aı | n d | | 17 | ? | | | | |
| 2 | | Α. | Yes | , | si | r. | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Q. | Wha | t | is | tŀ | nis | s · | a | рh | 01 | t o | g | ra | p l | n c | of? | ? | |
| 4 | | Α. | Tha | t | is | go | oiı | ng | t | 0 | be | Э | t: | h e | : 1 | vel | nic | :1 | е |
| 5 | that | the O | sbo | rn | e s | w e | ere | е | in | • | | | | | | | | | |
| . 6 | | Q. | And | , | ag | air | 1, | w. | h a | t | i | 3 | t | h i | S | a | | | |
| . 7 | photo | graph | of | ? | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| . 8 | | Α. | Tha | t' | s | an | 0 - | ve | ra | 11 | . (| o f | | t h | е | C | cir | nе | |
| . 9 | scene | area | • | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| : 0 | | Q. | Do | уο | u | kno | w | w | hi | c h | 1 6 | a p | a | rt | : m e | en t | <u>.</u> | | |
| 1 | build | ing t | hе | рa | rt | y v | va: | s | bе | in | g | h | е. | 1 d | l : | in: | ? | | |
| 2 | | Α. | It' | ន | go | ing | 3 | to | b | е | 01 | n | t | h e | e . | lov | v e j | <u>-</u> | |
| : 3 | right | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4 | | Q. | You | С | an | рı | re: | ss | t | h a | ιt | b | u | tt | 01 | n a | ano | Ĺ | |
| : 5 | indic | ate i | t t | hе | re | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

1 A. Okay. All right. The party was 2 held right there. Now, what is this a photograph 3 Q. of? 5 That's the overall view of the crime scene. 6 7 And that one? Ο. 8 Α. Same thing. Now this, what are we looking at 9 here? 10 11 Α. That's the building where the 12party was being held at. 13 Q. And what is this? 14 Α. That's the actual apartment right 15 here. 16 Q. And what -- that area there, does 17 that indicate the porch some people have 18 been referring to? 19 Α. Yes, sir. 20 And another photograph? Q. Yes, sir. 21 Α. 22 Q. What is this a photograph from? 2/3 That's going to be the back side 24 of the buildings. 25

The reverse angle?

Q.

Α. Right. MR. POWELL: I don't think I have 3 anything further of this witness, Judge. 4 THE COURT: Mr. Hartley. 5 CROSS-EXAMINATION 6 BY MR. HARTLEY: 7 Q. Detective Howton, do you have any 8 of the supplemental offense reports that 9 you prepared as case agent of this case, do 10 you have any of those with you? 11 I've got several right here in 12 the case file. 13 You do have them so you can refer 14 to them if I ask you to refer to them, 15 right? 16 Α. Yes. 17 When you began your testimony, 18 Mr. Powell asked you about some of the 19 steps you took in conducting your 20 investigation and you did say that you **2**1 talked to a Nicole Judkins; is that right? 22 Α. Yes, sir. 23 And you talked to Darryl Foggy, I believe? 25 Α. Yes, sir.

But you talked to several other 1 Ο. 2 people beyond that, didn't you? Yes, sir. 3 Α. Did you speak to a Bryant Thomas? Ο. 5 Yes, sir. Α. 6 All right. And, of course, you Ο. 7 took -- did you take statements from Eric Stewart? 8 9 Yes, sir. Ά. 10 Ο. One of them or both of them? 11 I took one of them, yes. 12 And was it -- were you the person 13 that Eric Stewart divulged the information 14 about the location of Darryl Foggy's gun? 15 Yes, sir, he was. Α. 16 Now, could you refer to your 17 supplemental offense report that was 18 prepared on February the 5th, '02. I know 19 there are more than one in the file. So I 20 will try to give you a reference point 21 here. It is called a follow-up 22 investigation. The first line of this --23 I'm sorry. Let me give you -- it is a fourteen page long report. So you notice 24

it is one of the more lengthy ones.

2.5

starts off on Saturday, February 2nd, '02. 1 Can you find that one? 2 Can you tell me what date the 3 supplement was done? 4 On February the 5th, '02, at 840 5 Q. It is a fourteen page report. hours. 6 Fourteen page? 7 Α. Let me show you the first page of Q. 8 it. 9 I've got it right here. 10 Α. Q. That's the one. 11 Okay. 12 Α. And this is something that you 13 Q. 14 prepared in the course of our investigation; is that right? 15 16 Α. Yes, sir. And it memorializes a lot of 17 things that happened, right? 18 19 Α. Yes. I want you to refer, if you will 20 -- let me be sure I get to the right 21 22 place. 23 MR. HARTLEY: I'm sorry, Judge. I've got so many pages. 24 Yes. On page nine, if you will. 25 Ο.

In the first paragraph of that part of the report -- well, on the previous page and the top paragraph on page nine, I think that's where you are writing your notes that you made that recorded Eric Stewart's disclosing where the gun was that was Darryl Foggy's gun; is that right?

A. Yes, sir.

Q. And at the end of that paragraph you wrote the following, and I want you to explain it to the Court. The sentence is written: At this time it is unknown as to reason why Eric Stewart took Foggy's gun and hid the gun. I think there is a typo there. It is A-N but it is probably and hid the gun, end of sentence.

At that time, did you have some information that would have led you to write in this report that Eric Stewart had hidden Foggy's gun, Darryl Foggy's gun?

- A. No, but at that time I was having some doubt as to which Darryl was actually involved.
- Q. But that's not the same question. The question is: Your report

says, at this time it is unknown as the 1 reason why Eric Stewart took Foggy's gun and hid the gun. I mean, you didn't just 3 write that as a casual matter of no importance, did you? 5 A. I didn't know. I don't know why 6 7 he took the gun. That's why I --8 But something made you put it in 9 your report that there was an open question 10 as to why Eric Stewart hid Darryl Foggy's 11 gun, right? 12 Correct. Α. 13 And did you in fact get some 14 information from a lady named Ms. Works? 15 Yes. Α. 16 It is down at the bottom of that 17 same page, isn't it? 18 Α. Yes. 19 And what did she tell you about 20 Darryl Foggy's gun? 21 MR. POWELL: Your Honor, we are 22 going to object to hearsay. 23 MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, it is 24 written in his report. 25 MR. POWELL: It is still hearsay.

0

2/2

2/3

2/5

THE COURT: It is still hearsay.

Q. Well, I won't ask you what she said. Did you record in your report information from Ms. Works that also referenced the fact that Eric Stewart had hid Darryl Foggy's gun?

MR. POWELL: Your Honor, we are going to object to the double hearsay.

MR. HARTLEY: That's not hearsay. That's what he wrote in his report, Judge.

MR. POWELL: It makes it hearsay. THE COURT: It is still hearsay.

- Q. So you can't tell us why you wrote in the report after having talked with all these people something about Eric Stewart having hidden Darryl Foggy's gun?
 - A. Repeat that one more time.
- Q. I'm going back to my question a moment ago. Did you write in the report that you had an -- an open question or -- it was unknown to you why Eric Stewart had taken and hidden Darryl Foggy's gun?
 - A. That's right. I didn't know why.
 - Q. But you wrote that in there for

some reason, right? 1 2 3 4 5 Α. 7 to the party that night. 9 0 11 12 3 4 15 the report. Page eight. 16 Α. The same report. 17 Ο. Α. 18 19 had committed the offense? 20 21 22

23

24

25

I was questioning it, yes. Let me ask you about your interview or your statement or your -- I don't think you took a statement from Bryant Thomas. Who was Bryant Thomas? Bryant Thomas is the subject that walked over there with James Friendly, over And I guess on the next day, Saturday, were you interviewing him about the -- his knowledge of this case? Did I speak to him on Saturday? Let me refer you to page eight of I did speak to him on Saturday. Did you ask him if he knew who MR. POWELL: Your Honor, at this point it may be a little premature but we are going to object to the substance of anything that Bryant Thomas told the

detective as that would be hearsay if it

doesn't come from Bryant Thomas himself.

MR. HARTLEY: We've got Bryan

Thomas to testify if we need to, Judge. I will just ask him about this exhibit.

We've got an exhibit that came from his file. We can ask him about that.

MR. POWELL: True.

MR. HARTLEY: Okay.

- Q. Without telling me, you know, words that Bryan Thomas said, did you go through a process with Bryan Thomas to possibly narrow down or specifically identify a suspect who committed this offense?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. Did you show him one of these photo arrays that we have heard testimony about in this case earlier?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Now this photo array -- you can see what I have in my hand here, can't you, from a distance? What kind of photo array is this? It is not the same as this book over here, is it?
 - A. That's more or less a photo

lineup.

К

3

- Q. Right. Is this designed so that a person might be able to pick somebody out of a group and say this is a person who committed the offense?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. All right. And did you go through that process with Mr. Bryan Thomas?
 - A. Yes.

MR. HARTLEY: Now, this has not been admitted or offered yet, I don't believe.

MR. POWELL: Not yet.

- Q. It bears a sticker called State's Exhibit 26. I'm going to show it to you now. See if you can identify that for the Record and for the jury and tell us what you know about that lineup?
- A. This is a lineup that is signed by Bryant Thomas and he is identifying photograph number three in this lineup.
- Q. All right. Now, he -- I want you to be specific because when you asked him to identify this, you identify someone from that photo, were you asking him to identify

persons who were present or the person who committed the offense against James
Friendly?

- A. Usually when I show a lineup like this, it is to see who he knows that pulled the trigger, if we can identify the suspect.
- Q. And did you record in your report that Bryan Thomas had positively identified number three, the photograph of number three, as being the person who he claimed was the subject that was involved in the shooting of James Friendly?
 - A. Yes, sir.

4

- Q. Who is the subject -- who is the picture in number three?
 - A. Darryl Foggy.
- Q. Would you hold that up and just show it to the jury and point to Darryl Foggy's picture?
 - A. Number three right here.
- Q. So this is a person who was identified by an eye witness as being the shooter on the morning of --

MR. POWELL: Judge, we object to

the fact that it is not in evidence as 1 Bryan Thomas being an eye witness. 2 THE COURT: Overruled. 3 Did he tell you that he saw what 4 happened out there? 5 MR. POWELL: Objection, Your 6 Honor. Hearsay. 7 MR. HARTLEY: Okay. Strike 8 that. We are not going into any possible 9 hearsay. 10 But you went through this process 11 and he said -- that is the result of --12 that identification is the result of your 13 interview with Mr. Bryan Thomas, right? 14 Α. Yes, sir. 15 Okay. And you reported in your 16 report that he positively identified him as 17 the shooter? 18 Yes. Α. 19 Thank you. Further on in your Q. 20 report, if I can find it. Let me go back. 21 Did you talk to Nicole Judkins? I believe 22 you identified her as one of the people you 23 interviewed? 24

A. Yes.

| 1 | Q. In your interview with her, did |
|-----|---|
| 2 | she identify Darryl Foggy as being one of |
| 3 | the people that was at the party? |
| 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | Q. Did she say that she knew he had |
| 6 | a gun? |
| 7 | MR. POWELL: Objection, Your |
| 8 | Honor. The question calls for hearsay. |
| 9 | Q. Have you recorded in your report |
| 0 | that she knew about a gun being at the |
| 1 | party? |
| . 2 | MR. POWELL: Objection, Your |
| . 3 | Honor. That question calls for double |
| . 4 | hearsay, what someone said and whether it |
| . 5 | was put in a written document. |
| . 6 | MR. HARTLEY: Your Honor, she is |
| . 7 | a witness in the case and will testify |
| . 8 | later. If we have to recall this witness, |
| . 9 | we will do it. |
| 2 0 | MR. POWELL: She can testify to |
| 2.1 | it but as to |
| 2 2 | THE COURT: I will sustain the |
| 2 3 | objection. |
| 2 4 | Q. Did Nicole Judkins have |
| 2 5 | information about this case? |

| T | A. 165. |
|--------|---|
| 2 | Q. Did she have knowledge of the gun |
| 3 | that is sitting on that counter right |
| 4 | there, on the table? |
| 5 | A. She had knowledge of a gun, yes. |
| 6 | Q. Who did okay. And whose gun |
| 7 | is this supposed to be? |
| 8 | A. Mr. Foggy's. |
| 9 | Q. Now let's go back. |
| 10 | MR. HARTLEY: And if counsel |
| 1 1 | would assist me, I would like to ask you to |
| 1 2 | put up the screen that shows the schematic |
| 13 | of the property. |
| 1 4 | MR. POWELL: The whole thing? |
| 15 | MR. HARTLEY: The aerial, that's |
| 16 | it. |
| 17 | Q. You testified about the State's |
| 18 | Exhibits 15, 16 and 17 being shell casings |
| 1 9 | recovered? |
| 20 | A. Is that the numbers for the shell |
| 2 1 | casings? |
| 2 2 | MS. PERKINS: Yes. |
| 2 3 | MR. POWELL: The shell casings. |
| 2 4 | A. Okay. Yes, sir. |
| 25 | Q. In all of your statements in |

all the statements that were taken from 1 various witnesses, did anybody say that 2 there were just three shots fired? I have had information -- well, I got information, it was supposed to be 5 several other shots fired in this case. 6 Did witnesses tell you that there 7 were as many as six shots fired or numbers 8 9 in that range? I have had five and six shots. I 10 had eight or nine shots. 11 But only three shell casings were 12 found out there, right? 1 з Correct. Α. 1 4 And if this scene all happened 15 right here in this area and if it all 16 happened in a matter of seconds, is it --17 by the way, do you have some familiarity 18 with guns? 19 Sir? Α. 20 You have some familiarity with 21 handquns? 22 Some, yes. Α. 23 I'm not trying to qualify you as 24 an expert but could you distinguish between 25

an automatic pistol and a revolver? 1 Α. Yes. Does a revolver have a round --3 I'm going to call it a cylinder, where it 4 holds all of the shells in there and as it 5 is fired does it kick out the empty shells? Α. No. 7 Is that a revolver laying on that 8 table? 9 No. Α. 10 It is considered an automatic? Q. 11 Semiautomatic, yes, sir. Α. 12 Semiautomatic. If the weapon ο. 13 fired out there that night was kicking 14 shell casings out or throwing them on the 15 ground, what kind of gun would it most 16 likely be? 17 Semiautomatic or an automatic. 18 Does the semiautomatic, when it 19 is being fired, does it stop kicking the 20 shells out, you know, along the way or does 21 it eject every single spent cartridge? 22 It ejects each casing as it is 23 Α. fired. 24

25

Q.

So wouldn't it be a logical

inference that if someone had shot out there five or six times that there should have been more shell casings on the ground?

A. Yes.

1. З

- Q. And your officers are supposed to be out there conducting a thorough search to find all the evidence that they can find out there, right?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. And y'all have got plenty of manpower to go out there and scour the ground and find all the shell casings, right?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Would it be a reasonable inference that someone probably picked up some shell casings and made off with them from that scene?
- A. I think there would have been some difficulty in doing that because of the grass because we went back out there and looked around. Of course, Grandison was able to find those three casings but we looked all over that area but we were unable to find anymore shell casings.

| 1 . | A. He has got a long name. I can't |
|-----|--|
| 2 | think of his name. It is in the file. |
| 3 | Q. Did that person have a connection |
| 4 | to this matter? |
| 5 | A. No, did not. |
| 6 | Q. How did his name get into your |
| 7 | file? |
| 8 | A. Because his name his nickname |
| 9 | is also Poncho. |
| 1 0 | Q. Tell us who it is. I don't know |
| 11 | where that is in the file right now. I |
| 1 2 | have been trying to keep up with some of |
| 13 | these names, but if you could help me, I |
| 14 | sure would like to know who that is. |
| 15 | Mr. Powell has found it. He |
| 16 | tells me it is in your February 13 report, |
| 1 7 | page five. |
| 18 | A. Yeah. Here it is. Alwin |
| 19 | Darius. I will spell the middle name, |
| 2 0 | A-Q-U-A-N-T-I-S-E, Owens, O-W-E-N-S. |
| 2 1 | Q. And what connection, if any, did |
| 2 2 | he have? Was he at the scene? |
| 2 3 | A. I was never given his name at all |
| 2 4 | at the scene, no. |

MR. HARTLEY: One moment, Judge.

| 1 | Q. In your record, there is a |
|-----|--|
| 2 | reference to Nicole Judkins, information |
| 3 | about a gun, right? |
| 4 | A. Yes. |
| 5 | Q. And does your report reflect the |
| 6 | color that she said the gun was? |
| 7 | A. Black. |
| 8 | Q. Okay. |
| 9 | MR. HARTLEY: No further |
| 10 | questions. |
| 1 1 | REDIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 1 2 | BY MR. POWELL: |
| 1 3 | Q. Detective, Mr. Hartley asked you |
| 14 | questions about is it possible the number |
| 1 5 | of shots fired and other shell casings. Is |
| 1 6 | it possible that in between those two |
| 17 | buildings there could have been an echo? |
| 18 | A. It is possible, yes. |
| 19 | Q. And it is also possible other |
| 20 | witnesses just didn't hear the number of |
| 2 1 | shots that were actually fired? |
| 2 2 | A. That's correct. |
| 2 3 | Q. Is that common when you are |
| 2 4 | investigating a shooting incidents to have |
| 2 5 | wild variations in the number of shots |

people heard?

Α. Yes. Now, let's talk about back to 3 this initial investigation. Now, 4 initially, you would agree with me, you 5 were in fact looking at two different 6 Darryls as possible suspects? 7 That's correct. Α. 8 And the fact that this Bryan Q. 9 Thomas identified Darryl Foggy out of a 10 photo lineup was one of the things you were 11 using to develop Darryl Foggy as a possible 1 2 suspect? 13 Α. Yes. 1 4 At any point were you able to 15 exclude the other Darryl, Darryl Joyce, as 16 a possible suspect? 17 No. 18 Α. Why? Ο. 19 I couldn't find Mr. Joyce. Α. 20 Were you able to locate and 2 1 Q. follow up on Darryl Foggy? 2 2 2 3 Α. Yes. How? Q. 24 I located Mr. Foggy and -- plus, 25 Α.

the recovery of the gun. Then, of course, like I said, we interviewed Mr. Foggy. 2 Now, is it common in homicide 3 investigations to potentially have two 4 suspects that are developed? 5 Α. Yes. б And is it standard procedure in 7 those type of investigations to follow up 8 on both of the suspects? 9 Yes. Α. 10 And in this case, were you able ο. 11 to exclude either one of those suspects? 12 Yes. Α. 1 3 Which one? Q. 1 4 MR. HARTLEY: Objection, Your 15 Honor. I object to the form of the 16 question. Exclude means that that's some 1 7 sort of conclusion or mental process of 18 this witness. 19 THE COURT: I agree. 2 0 Which suspect did you eventually Q. 2 1 sign warrants on? 2 2 Α. Mr. Joyce. 2 3 MR. POWELL: No further 24 2.5 questions.

1

RECROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. HARTLEY: Just a couple questions about 3 those number of shots. Mr. Powell has 4 raised the issue there could have been an 5 echo out there, right? 6 Yes, sir. Α. 7 How many shots were -- how many 8 injury wounds did Mr. Friendly -- James 9 Friendly have, do you know that? 10 He had three injuries. Α. 11 And wasn't there a vehicle out 12 there that had broken glass or was hit by a 13 bullet in some kind of way? 14 A. Yes. 15 Okay. How many times was that 16 vehicle hit? 17 I don't know. I never saw that 18 vehicle. 19 Do you know from records that it 20 was hit more than once? 21 Α. Yes. 22 So we are way above three shots 23 right there, aren't we? 24 Α. Yes. 2.5

| 1 | MR. HARTLEY: Okay. Thank you. |
|-----|--|
| 2 | REDIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 3 | BY MR. POWELL: |
| 4 | Q. Detective, some of those shots |
| 5 | that hit Mr. Friendly went all the way |
| 6 | through his body and came out the other |
| 7 | side, did they not? |
| 8 | A. Yes. |
| 9 | Q. Could the same three shots that |
| L 0 | hit him possibly hit the Jeep as well? |
| L 1 | A. It is possible, yes. |
| L 2 | MR. POWELL: Nothing further, |
| 1 3 | Judge. |
| 1 4 | RECROSS-EXAMINATION |
| 1 5 | BY MR. HARTLEY: |
| 16 | Q. Do you think that's a very |
| 1 7 | minimal probability, like almost |
| 18 | impossible, for bullets to be fired in a |
| 19 | downward direction to go up and then hit a |
| 2 0 | vehicle? What would you give the |
| 2 1 | probability out of a hundred? What |
| 2 2 | percentage would you give? |
| 2 3 | A. I don't know. I mean, the |
| 2 4 | possibility exists that it could happen. |
| 2 5 | That's the only way I can answer that. |

| 1 | MR. HARTLEY: Thank you. No |
|-----|---|
| 2 | further questions. |
| 3 | MR. POWELL: Nothing further, |
| 4 | Judge. |
| 5 | THE COURT: Thank you. You can |
| 6 | step down. Why don't we take a short |
| 7 | break. If y'all can be back here in the |
| 8 | jury assembly room at a quarter after. |
| 9 | (The jury exits the courtroom.) |
| 10 | (Brief Recess.) |
| 11 | MR. POWELL: The State calls |
| 1 2 | Katherine Richart. |
| 13 | KATHERINE RICHART, |
| 14 | having been first duly sworn, was examined |
| 15 | and testified as follows: |
| 16 | DIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 17 | BY MR. POWELL: |
| 18 | Q. Would you state your name for the |
| 19 | members of the jury? |
| 2 0 | A. Katherine Richart. |
| 2 1 | Q. And how are you employed, Ms. |
| 2 2 | Richart? |
| 2 3 | A. I'm employed with the Alabama |
| 2 4 | Department of Forensic Sciences, Montgomery |
| 2 5 | Regional Laboratory. |

| 1 | Q. What is your job with the |
|-----|---|
| 2 | Department of Forensic Sciences? |
| 3 | A. I'm a forensic scientist |
| 4 | specializing in firearms and tool mark |
| 5 | identification. |
| 6 | Q. Briefly, for the jurors, explain |
| 7 | to us what that is? |
| 8 | A. Basically, what I do is I look at |
| 9 | fire bullets and fire cartridge cases and |
| 1 0 | try to microscopically compare those back |
| 1 1 | to a specific firearm. |
| L 2 | Q. What training, education or |
| L 3 | experience have you had to qualify you as a |
| 1 4 | firearms analyst or a tool marks examiner? |
| 1 5 | A. I have a bachelor's degree in |
| 1 6 | science from the University of Alabama at |
| 1 7 | Birmingham. I have trained for |
| 1 8 | two-and-a-half years. Been to the Alabama |
| 1 9 | Department of Forensic Science in the |
| 2 0 | examination of firearms and tool marks |
| 2 1 | evidence. I have attended two one-week |
| 2 2 | courses put on by the California |
| 2 3 | Criminalist Institute. I have attended |
| 2 4 | seven one-week training seminars put on by |
| 2 5 | the Association of Firearms and Tool Marks |

Examiners. I have attended armored courses 1 put on by Bloch, Smith and Wesson, Savage, 2 Seek (sic) and Colt, and I have attended 3 the FBI Firearms Instructor School and the 4 Certified Instructor in Rifles, Missiles 5 and Shotguns by the FBI. 6 MR. POWELL: Your Honor, we move 7 to qualify Ms. Richart as an expert in 8 firearms analysis and tool mark 9 examination. 10 THE COURT: Okay. 11 Mr. Richart, were you submitted 12 some evidence to examine in the case 13 involving the victim of James Friendly? 14 That tox. number is going to be 15 2002-MM00226. 16 Yes, I was. 17 Α. And do you have a file with that 18 same tox. number? 19 Yes, I do. 2.0 And what does that number 21 Ο. indicate to you? Which case is this about? 22 Well, it is -- our department 23 gives a case number for every case we 24 enter. In this case it was a death case. 25

Q. So anything with this 226 number 1 on it involves the shooting death of James 2 Friendly? 3 That is correct. Α. 4 In other words, the firearms and 5 0. physical evidence you analyzed? 6 That is correct. Α. 7 Now I'm going to present to you 8 three casings and a photograph. I need to 9 mark State's 31. Also, State's 21. First 10 off, I think we have been wondering the 11 whole trial, is that weapon safe? 12 It is. Α. 13 Is it unloaded? 14 Ο. Yes, I have. 15 Α. And have you examined it prior to 16 Q. coming in the courtroom today? 17 Α. Yes, I did. 18 Did you test fire that weapon? Q. 19 Yes, I did. 20 Α. Is it operational? Will it 2 1 Q. shoot? 22 It will. 23 Α. But you made sure it didn't have 24 any bullets in it? 25

| 1 | A. That's correct. |
|-----|--|
| 2 | Q. Ms. Richart, I'm going to put |
| 3 | State's 15, 16 and 17 on the overhead here |
| 4 | so we can see them a little closer. |
| 5 | Now, take a look at your records |
| 6 | and tell me if these three shell casings, |
| 7 | the projectile from State's 31 and a gun |
| 8 | were basically the physical evidence you |
| 9 | received in this case? |
| 10 | A. I am, but may I look at the |
| 11 | cartridge cases just to be sure? |
| 12 | Q. Sure. Here you go. |
| 13 | A. (Witness examining evidence.) |
| 14 | Q. While we are doing this, do you |
| 15 | recognize State's 31? |
| 16 | A. Yes, I do. |
| 17 | Q. What is it? |
| 18 | A. It is a fired copper jacket |
| 19 | bullet. |
| 2 0 | Q. A picture |
| 2 1 | A. A picture of a fired copper |
| 2 2 | jacket bullet. |
| 2 3 | Q. Does this picture fairly and |
| 2 4 | accurately represent the actual physical |
| 2 5 | object you examined? |

| 1 | A. Yes, it does. |
|-----|---|
| 2 | MR. POWELL: We offer State's 31, |
| 3 | Judge. |
| 4 | THE COURT: Admitted. |
| 5 | (State's Exhibit Number 31 |
| 6 | admitted into evidence.) |
| 7 | Q. Now you have had an opportunity |
| 8 | to examine State's 15, 16 and 17, the shell |
| 9 | casings. |
| 10 | A. That's correct. |
| 11 | Q. Are these the actual casings you |
| 1 2 | examined? |
| 13 | A. Yes, they are. |
| 1 4 | Q. First, let's start with the |
| 15 | projectile, State's 31. Did this bullet |
| 16 | come from this gun? |
| 1 7 | A. No, it did not. |
| 18 | Q. And now let's go to the shell |
| 1 9 | casings. Did you examine those shell |
| 2 0 | casings? |
| 2 1 | A. Yes, I did. |
| 2 2 | Q. Did any three of those shell |
| 2 3 | casings come from this gun, State's 21? |
| 2 4 | A. They were not fired in the |
| 2 5 | chamber of that firearm, no, sir. |

O. How do you know that?

2 5

A. When I received the Franklin

Jennings pistol and I test fired that and collected the fired bullets and the fired cartridge cases and then microscopically compared those back to the cartridge cases and the bullets that were submitted in this case, I was able to determine microscopically that these particular cartridge cases, State's Exhibits 15, 16 and 17, were not fired in the chamber of State's Exhibit 21.

- Q. In case you need to refer to any of it. So scientifically that gun didn't shoot any of these bullets; is that right?
- A. The cartridge cases were not fired in the chamber of that firearm nor was the bullet, State's Exhibit 31, which is the picture of the bullet, fired through the barrel of this firearm, that is correct.
- Q. Now what can you tell us about the projectile itself?
- A. I can tell you that the copper jacket and bullet that I received was a

nine millimeter thirty-eight class and from the general rifling characteristics of this bullet, mainly the number of lands and grooves and the actual measurements of those lands and grooves, I was able to determine that it was most probably fired but not limited to a High Point pistol.

- Q. And is the pistol in front of you a High Point?
 - A. No, it's not.

- Q. Explain for us briefly the lands and grooves and why you have to measure them and can that tell you anything.
- A. Prior to manufacture of a barrel of a firearm, the manufacturer decides how many lands and grooves they are going to place in the barrel. And what these lands and grooves do, it is what gives the bullet the spin as it comes out of the barrel, kind of like throwing a football. It stabilizes the bullet in flight. An example, Smith and Wesson has five lands and grooves with a right-handed twist, where a Colt has six lands and grooves with a left-handed twist.

| 1 | This data is put together with |
|-----|---|
| 2 | the FBI from all the gun manufacturers and |
| 3 | I get a list of that that is updated |
| 4 | annually of all the gun manufacturers' |
| 5 | specifications, not only how many lands and |
| 6 | grooves a gun manufacturer puts in the |
| 7 | barrel but the actual measurement of the |
| 8 | groove that is put in there. And those |
| 9 | from lands and groove measurements, I'm |
| 10 | able to determine the possibility of a |
| 11 | bullet coming from a particular |
| 12 | manufacturer. |
| 13 | Q. And in this case it was a High |
| 14 | Point type of weapon? |
| 15 | A. Yes, it was. |
| 16 | Q. What kind of caliber did you say |
| 17 | this was? |
| 18 | A. A thirty-eight nine millimeter. |
| 19 | Q. What does that mean? |
| 2 0 | A. That the bullet caliber, the |
| 2 1 | diameter of the bullet measured .355s of an |
| 2 2 | inch, which is consistent with a nine |
| 2 3 | millimeter or a thirty-eight class caliber |
| 2.4 | firearm. |

Q. Why can't you differentiate

| 1 | between a thirty-eight or a nine |
|-----|--|
| 2 | millimeter? |
| 3 | A. Because they have the same |
| 4 | diameter. |
| 5 | Q. Now, this does High Point make |
| б | an automatic weapon consistent with a nine |
| 7 | millimeter? |
| 8 | A. Yes, they do. Many. |
| 9 | Q. Many? |
| 10 | A. (Witness nodding head |
| 11 | affirmatively.) |
| 12 | Q. And the lands and grooves on that |
| 13 | particular projectile in this photograph |
| 1 4 | match the same from various models from |
| 15 | High Point automatic weapons? |
| 16 | A. This bullet had nine lands and |
| 17 | grooves with a left-handed twist, which is |
| 18 | consistent with High Point firearms. |
| 19 | Q. And that, of course, would be |
| 2 0 | different from the lands and grooves |
| 21 | produced on the test bullet from this gun, |
| 22 | State's 21? |
| 2 3 | A. That is correct. |
| 24 | Q. Now, can you determine whether or |
| 25 | not the same gun well, let me ask you |

| 1 | this: Let's talk about the shell casings. |
|-----|---|
| 2 | Did you test the shell casings? |
| 3 | A. Yes, I did. |
| 4 | Q. What can you tell us about the |
| 5 | shell casings? |
| 6 | A. That these I received two |
| 7 | fired Federal brand and one fired Remington |
| 8 | brand cartridge case. They were all |
| 9 | caliber nine millimeter, and I |
| 10 | microscopically compared those to each |
| 11 | other and was able to determine that they |
| 12 | were all fired in the chamber of the same |
| 13 | firearm. |
| 14 | Q. Okay. That firearm, was that |
| 15 | State's 21? |
| 16 | A. No, it was not. |
| 17 | Q. The marks on these shell casings |
| 18 | did not match that gun in front of you? |
| 19 | A. That is correct. |
| 2 0 | Q. Okay. How can you tell about a |
| 21 | shell casing whether or not it came from a |
| 22 | particular gun? |
| 2 3 | A. Again, during the gun |
| 2 4 | manufacture, there is a process that is |
| 25 | used to make the actual groove to the |

firearm, which is when a cartridge is fired 1 where the cartridge case is -- the pressure 2 of the powder burning which pushes the 3 bullet down the barrel with an equal and opposite pressure, the cartridge case is 5 going to slam up against the breech. 6 Whatever tool was used to make that breech 7 space, it has microscopic marks as well, 8 along with the firing pin, however the 9 firing pin is manufactured, and it leaves a 10 unique mark on a cartridge case. 11 Q. Okay. Now you spoke of a firing 12 pin. How do you look to where the firing 13 pin left a mark? 14 How do I look? 15 Yes. Can you see it on the shell Q. 16 casing itself? 17 You can. Α. 18 Okay. Can you point that out to 19 us? 20 Α. Sure. 21 You can just use this. Let's 22 Q. make it look bigger. 23 This here is the head of the 24 cartridge case where it says nine

2.5

millimeter Luger, and I believe this is an 1 This is the Federal brand cartridge 2 case. This right here is the primer of the 3 cartridge case, which is what the firing 4 pin hits, which this is the firing pin 5 indentation right here. 6 The firing pin hits here which 7 ignites the primer, which is what ignites 8 the powder that burns. So the whole breech 9 of this can be marked by the breech facing 10 the firearm. But most of the microscopic 11 marks that we look at are on the primer 12 because it is of a softer metal. 13 Q. Now, Ms. Richart, does the fact 14 that these three shell casings, two come 15 from one brand and one is another, does 16 that indicate more than one firearm 17 present? 18 No, it does not. Α. 19 Why not? Q. 20 Because you can load any 21 ammunition manufacturer in a particular 22

Q. Is there anything about those three casings that would definitively

firearm.

23

24

| 1 | determine whether they came from one or |
|-----|---|
| 2 | more firearms? |
| 3 | A. These three fired cartridge cases |
| 4 | were all fired from the chamber of the same |
| 5 | firearm. |
| 6 | MR. POWELL: I think that's all |
| 7 | the questions I have for Ms. Richart. |
| 8 | MR. HARTLEY: No cross. |
| 9 | THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. |
| 10 | MR. POWELL: The State calls Dr. |
| 11 | Ben Bristol, Judge. |
| 12 | DR. BEN BRISTOL, |
| 13 | having been first duly sworn, was examined |
| 1 4 | and testified as follows: |
| 1 5 | DIRECT EXAMINATION |
| 16 | BY MR. POWELL: |
| 17 | Q. Could you state your name for the |
| 18 | jury? |
| 19 | A. My name is Dr. Ben Bristol. |
| 2 0 | Q. Dr. Bristol, how are you |
| 21 | currently employed? |
| 2 2 | A. I work for the National Medical |
| 2 3 | Examiner's office. |
| 2 4 | Q. And at one time were you employed |
| 25 | by the Alabama Department of Forensic |

| 1 | would, explain to the jury what is the |
|-----|---|
| 2 | difference between forensic medicine and |
| 3 | normal medicine? |
| 4 | A. Forensic medicine concerns itself |
| 5 | with the examination of dead people with |
| 6 | doing autopsies, determines causes and |
| 7 | manners of death, whether it is a natural |
| 8 | death or a heart attack or a hanging or a |
| 9 | all different sorts. We concern |
| 10 | ourselves primarily with violent, |
| 11 | suspicious or unnatural deaths. |
| 12 | MR. POWELL: Your Honor, at this |
| 13 | point, we would like to |
| 14 | Q. Let me show you this, Doctor. I |
| 15 | have marked this as Exhibit 20-A. Do you |
| 16 | recognize that? |
| 17 | A. Yes, sir. |
| 18 | Q. Is this your curriculum vitae? |
| 19 | A. Yes, it is. |
| 2 0 | Q. And is this listing of your |
| 21 | credentials basically a resume? |
| 2 2 | A. Yes, sir. |
| 2 3 | MR. POWELL: We offer State's |
| 2 4 | 20-A, Your Honor. |
| 2 5 | THE COURT: It's admitted. |

```
(State's Exhibit Number 20-A
1
           admitted into evidence.)
2
                     MR. POWELL: Judge, at this point
3
           we move to qualify Dr. Bristol as an expert
4
           in autopsy examination.
5
                     THE COURT: Okay.
 6
                      MR. HARTLEY: Have you
 7
           established how many times he has done
 8
 9
           this?
                    How many autopsies have you
10
                Ο.
           performed, Doctor?
11
                A. I performed perhaps six to seven
12
           hundred autopsies, at least that number.
13
           And maybe a hundred and fifty homicides.
14
                      MR. POWELL: Again, we renew our
15
           motion to qualify him as an expert.
16
                      THE COURT: Okay.
17
                     Now, Doctor, were you the medical
18
           examiner in the case involving the shooting
19
           death of James Friendly?
20
21
                Α.
                     Yes, sir.
                      And did you perform the autopsy
22
           in that case?
23
                     Yes, I did.
24
                 Α.
                    And as a result of your autopsy
25
```

did you prepare a record and make medical 1 findings related to the cause of death and 2 other observations you made in making that 3 autopsy? 4 Yes, sir. Α. 5 Now I'm going to show you State's б Exhibit 20. Do you recognize that? 7 Yes, I do. That is a diagram I Α. 8 prepared of the body of Mr. Friendly. 9 And it is a multipage or eight 10 page exhibit. Can you flip through there. 11 And incorporated in with that diagram is a 12 series of photographs with some lines and 13 arrows. Do you recognize those 14 photographs? 15 Yes, I recognize these. These 16 are photographs and the diagram I did of 17 the body of Mr. Friendly. 18 And as for the photographs and 19 diagrams, are they fair and accurate 20 representations of the manner of the body 21 during the autopsy you performed? 22 Yes, they are, sir. 23 And would the lines and arrows 24 assist you in explaining to the jury your 2.5

| 1. | findings for an autopsy report? |
|-----|---|
| 2 | A. Yes. The lines and the arrows |
| 3 | designate connect words that connect to |
| 4 | the wounds on the body. |
| 5 | MR. POWELL: We offer State's |
| 6 | Exhibit, Judge. |
| 7 | THE COURT: Which number is |
| 8 | that? |
| 9 | MR. POWELL: 20. |
| 10 | (State's Exhibit Number 20 |
| 11 | admitted into evidence.) |
| 12 | Q. Now, Doctor, I'm going to refer |
| 13 | to a blowup of State's 20 on the screen. |
| 14 | Is this the diagram you prepared? |
| 15 | A. Yes, sir, it is. |
| 16 | Q. Now, Doctor, three circles just |
| 17 | came up on the diagram. What do those |
| 18 | indicate? |
| 19 | A. Those indicate entry wounds. |
| 20 | Q. Now, entry wounds from what? |
| 21 | A. Entry wounds from a bullet, sir. |
| 22 | Q. Gunshot wounds? |
| 2 3 | A. Yes. Entry gunshot wounds. |
| 2 4 | Q. So how many gunshot wounds were |
| 2 5 | you able to identify on the body of James |

Friendly when you performed the autopsy? 1 There were three entrance gunshot 2 wounds. 3 Did you observe any other major trauma to Mr. Friendly other than, you know, medical treatment, that kind of 6 thing? 7 A. I am just reviewing my report 8 here and, no, there was no -- there was no 9 evidence of any trauma to the mouth or to 10 the hands. 11 Q. Basically three gunshot wounds? 12 The three entry gunshot wounds 13 and there were two exits. 14 O. Two exits? 15 Two exits, yes. Α. 16 Now, let's start with this wound 17 that just came up -- I think you have got 18 it marked as wound number one. What is 19 that a photograph of? 2.0 It's a photograph of the entrance 21 gunshot wound on the left side there of his 22 torso. 23 Q. The blue circle that just 24 appeared, what is that circling? 2 5

A. That's an exit on the right side 1 of the abdomen. 2 And the photograph? 3 Shows the tattoo and the exit 4 wound there with a ruler placed slightly 5 over it. 6 Q. And that photograph, what is that 7 a picture of? 8 A. It's another picture of the 9 10 wound. Dr. Bristol, how can you look at 11 this entrance would and exit wound and tell 12 us that one is an entrance as opposed to an 13 exit? 14 Sure. Take, for example, the 15 entrance wound, the one in the red circle. 16 You will see that there is a red -- you can 17 see that there is a red to black rim around 18 the central defect that is a little bit 19 more pink. That's very characteristic of 20 an entrance wound. That's what is referred 21 to as marginal rating. That's where a 22 bullet pushed in through the skin. 23 The exit wound on the other side, 24

the one surrounded by blue is a little more

| 1 | it is not as round as the other wound. |
|-----|---|
| 2 | It is more it is more of a laceration |
| 3 | kind of. That's how we tell it is an exit |
| 4 | wound. |
| 5 | Q. Now, Doctor, did you examine the |
| 6 | pathway the bullet traveled through Mr. |
| 7 | Friendly's body from this wound? |
| 8 | A. Yes, sir. |
| 9 | Q. And from that examination of the |
| 10 | pathway, can you scientifically determine |
| 11 | these two wounds are connected? |
| 12 | A. Yes. |
| 13 | Q. Now, Doctor, I want to talk about |
| 14 | another diagram came up with some |
| 15 | arrows drawn across it. Did you prepare |
| 16 | that diagram as well? |
| 17 | A. Yes, sir. |
| 18 | Q. And what do the red circles again |
| 19 | indicate? |
| 2 0 | A. The entrance wounds. |
| 21 | Q. And the blue circles? |
| 2 2 | A. The exit gunshot wound. |
| 2 3 | Q. Now, the green arrow, what does |
| 2 4 | that indicate? |
| 2 5 | A. More are or less the path of the |

| Case : | 2:05-cv-01009-ID-TFM Document 10-5 Filed 03/07/2006 Page 10 $\mathcal{L} - \mathcal{O}\mathcal{A} - \mathcal{A}\mathcal{A}$ |
|--------|---|
| | Party of |
| | DOCUMENT NAME: Joyce, Darry/ Jevon CLIENT & MATTER: 58199-001 |
| ٠. | CLIENT & MATTER: 58199-001 |
| | DESCRIPTION: County: Montgomery CC#s: 2002-1417 |
| | Attorney: Jean Therkelson Circle: TRANSCRIPT CASE FILE BOTH |
| | 3 volun |
| | |
| | CERTIFICATION |
| | I hereby certify that the preceding imaged records and documents |
| | are a true, accurate, and complete image of the original records or |
| | documents as received by the Office of the Attorney General of |
| | the State of Alabama. |
| | This the 19th day of January, 200 5. |
| · | Signed: Melisa a Martin |
| | Notary: Colean 7 Gibson |

Coleen F. Gibson Notary Public Commission expires 06/11/06